

# Studying Social Inequality with Data Science

INFO 3370 / 5371  
Spring 2023

## Rawls and Justice as Fairness

All page numbers refer to Rawls, John. 1971.  
*A Theory of Justice*. Harvard University Press.

# Learning goals for today

By the end of class, you will be able to explain

- ▶ the original position
- ▶ the equality principle
- ▶ the difference principle

What is justice?

Hypothetical American businessman:

Hypothetical American businessman:

I have a lot of money.

In America, I get to keep it.

In Sweden, I'd pay high taxes.

Therefore, I think America is more just.

Hypothetical American businessman:

I have a lot of money.  
In America, I get to keep it.  
In Sweden, I'd pay high taxes.  
Therefore, I think America is more just.

What makes it hard take the businessman's view  
as an objective assessment of the justice of society?

Hypothetical American businessman:

I have a lot of money.  
In America, I get to keep it.  
In Sweden, I'd pay high taxes.  
Therefore, I think America is more just.

What makes it hard take the businessman's view  
as an objective assessment of the justice of society?

If we want to agree about a just society,  
we cannot appeal to **our own place** within that society

How to choose principles for a just society?

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”
- ▶ “his class position or social status”

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”
- ▶ “his class position or social status”
- ▶ “his fortune in the distribution of natural assets and abilities”

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”
- ▶ “his class position or social status”
- ▶ “his fortune in the distribution of natural assets and abilities”
- ▶ “his intelligence, strength, and the like”

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”
- ▶ “his class position or social status”
- ▶ “his fortune in the distribution of natural assets and abilities”
- ▶ “his intelligence, strength, and the like”

What principles for society would we choose from this position?

# How to choose principles for a just society?

Choose from an **original position**

(Rawls p. 12)

- ▶ “no one knows his place in society”
- ▶ “his class position or social status”
- ▶ “his fortune in the distribution of natural assets and abilities”
- ▶ “his intelligence, strength, and the like”

What principles for society would we choose from this position?

- ▶ would we allow slavery?
- ▶ would we require complete equality?

## Two principles chosen in the original position

1. Equality principle
2. Difference principle

## First principle: Equality of liberty

“each person is to have an equal right to the most extensive basic liberty compatible with a similar liberty for others”

— Rawls p. 60

Second principle: Difference principle

## Second principle: Difference principle

Suppose that (Rawls p. 78)

1. Some are born in a property-owning entrepreneurial class
2. Some are born in a class of unskilled laborers

## Second principle: Difference principle

Suppose that

(Rawls p. 78)

1. Some are born in a property-owning entrepreneurial class
2. Some are born in a class of unskilled laborers
3. Set (1) has better economic prospects

## Second principle: Difference principle

Suppose that

(Rawls p. 78)

1. Some are born in a property-owning entrepreneurial class
2. Some are born in a class of unskilled laborers
3. Set (1) has better economic prospects

Is there any way that such a society could be just?

## Second principle: Difference principle

“social and economic inequalities are to be arranged so that they are both  
(a) reasonably expected to be to everyone’s advantage and  
(b) attached to positions and offices open to all”

— Rawls p. 60

How does this depart from other conceptions of justice?

## Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution”

p. 66

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong
- ▶ We flip a coin. Sarah is prohibited from applying

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong
- ▶ We flip a coin. Sarah is prohibited from applying
- ▶ Sarah lives in poverty. Frank is wealthy

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong
- ▶ We flip a coin. Sarah is prohibited from applying
- ▶ Sarah lives in poverty. Frank is wealthy

Is this a just allocation?

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong
- ▶ Only men are allowed to lift sandbags
- ▶ Sarah lives in poverty. Frank is wealthy

Is this a just allocation?

# Natural liberty

“a basic structure satisfying the principle of efficiency and in which positions are open to those able and willing to strive for them will lead to a just distribution” p. 66

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Sarah and Frank are both really strong
- ▶ Only men are allowed to lift sandbags
- ▶ Sarah lives in poverty. Frank is wealthy

Is this a just allocation?

Rawls: “social circumstances and such chance contingencies as accident and good fortune” are “arbitrary from a moral point of view” (p. 72)

Liberal equality

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills  
should have similar life chances”

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills  
should have similar life chances”

Hypothetical:

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills  
should have similar life chances”

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills  
should have similar life chances”

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Frank is born weak. Sarah is born really strong

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills should have similar life chances”

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Frank is born weak. Sarah is born really strong
- ▶ Frank lives in poverty. Sarah is wealthy

# Liberal equality

Rawls adds “fair equality of opportunity”:

p. 73

“those with similar abilities and skills should have similar life chances”

Hypothetical:

- ▶ It pays really well to lift sandbags up a hill
- ▶ Frank is born weak. Sarah is born really strong
- ▶ Frank lives in poverty. Sarah is wealthy

Is this fair?

## Social and natural chance are **both** arbitrary

“For once we are troubled by the influence of either social contingencies or natural chance on the determination of distributive shares, we are bound, on reflection, to be bothered by the influence of the other.

From a moral standpoint the two seem to be equally arbitrary.”

(Rawls p. 75)

If ability is arbitrary, can we ever justify inequality?

“The higher expectations of those better situated are just if and only if they work as part of a scheme which improves the expectations of the least advantaged members of society.”

— Rawls p. 75

## Recap: Two principles of justice

From the original position, Rawls thinks we would choose

1. **Equality of liberty:** “each person is to have an equal right to the most extensive basic liberty compatible with a similar liberty for others”
2. **Difference principle:** “social and economic inequalities are to be arranged so that they are both
  - (a) reasonably expected to be to everyone’s advantage and
  - (b) attached to positions and offices open to all”

Discussion. Is this justice?

# Learning goals for today

By the end of class, you will be able to explain

- ▶ the original position
- ▶ the equality principle
- ▶ the difference principle